

Regular Meeting

January 29, 2007  
12:30 p.m.

A regular meeting of the Municipal Civil Service Commission convened on Monday, January 29, 2007, at 12:40 p.m. with Grady Pettigrew and Eileen Paley in attendance.

\* \* \*

*RE: Review and approval of the minutes from the December 18, 2006, regular meeting.*

A motion to approve the minutes was made, seconded, and passed unanimously.

\* \* \*

RE: Review of the results of the pre-hearing conference reviews on the following appeals:

- a) Madison McRae vs. Columbus Public Schools, Bus Driver – 5-day suspension. Trial board hearing scheduled for April 9, 2007. Appeal No. 06-BA-0024.
- b) Susan Coats vs. Columbus Health Department, Payroll Clerk II – Discharge. Trial board hearing scheduled for March 21, 2007. Appeal No. 06-CA-0034.
- c) Lorene Rummel vs. Columbus Public Schools, Food Service Helper – Discharge. Trial board hearing scheduled for May 14, 2007. Appeal No. 06-BA-0027.

PRESENT: Theresa Lynn Carter, Deputy Executive Director

Madison McRae – Mr. McRae, Bus Driver for Columbus Public Schools, appealed a 5-day suspension as a result of him being involved in a traffic accident. Columbus Public Schools expects to call three witnesses and anticipates their portion of the trial board can be completed in one afternoon. The appellant will testify on his own behalf and his attorney also believes no additional time will be required to complete the trial board.

Susan Coats – Ms. Coats, Payroll Clerk II, Columbus Health Department, appealed her discharge after a fitness for duty hearing. The City expects to call five witnesses and the appellant expects to call four witnesses. Both parties agree the trial board should be completed in one afternoon.

Lorene Rummel – Ms. Rummel, Food Service Helper, Columbus Public Schools, appealed her discharge. Columbus Public Schools expects to call eight witnesses. In addition, Columbus Public School may request a site visit in order to view a videotape of the alleged injury on a security camera if they are unable to create a copy of the videotape to bring to the trial board; they will advise us by March 16. The appellant will testify on her own behalf and intends to submit medical documentation and an injury report. Because of the number of witnesses it may be necessary to expand the time of the trial board.

\* \* \*

*RE: Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to amend Rule X(E)(4-6) by deleting those sections that pertain to Commission policies and procedures.*

PRESENT: Theresa Lynn Carter, Deputy Executive Director

Theresa Carter presented this request to revise Rule X(E)(4-6) to reflect current and practices.

Several years ago, the voters amended City Charter section 149(h) to change the length of a temporary appointment from 30 days to 480 hours. Shortly after passage of the amendment, Rule X was modified to reflect the charter change, and to describe

the procedures departments should follow when submitting temporary appointment paperwork to the Commission.

The Commission now has an extensive Internal Operational Policies and Procedures (IOP&P) Manual. The manual standardizes the policies and procedures Commission staff should use regarding most of the primary Civil Service functions. Temporary appointments are covered in the IOP&P, and current language mirrors the language in Rule X(E)(4-6).

It was therefore requested that items 4, 5, and 6 of Rule X(E) be deleted and that the Rule reads as follows:

RULE X

APPOINTMENTS

E. Temporary Appointment

Pursuant to City Charter Section 149(h), a person who has been selected by an appointing authority to fill a vacancy on a temporary basis not to exceed 60 workdays within any twelve month period is said to have received a temporary appointment.

1. Whenever conditions arise such that an individual needs to be hired to perform work for a period not to exceed 60 workdays (480 work hours) within any consecutive twelve-month period, an appointing authority may appoint a qualified individual for said period as provided herein. For purposes of this section, eight work hours shall equal one workday.
2. The Commission reserves the right to inquire into the qualifications of a temporary employee, and to disapprove payment of compensation to such employee if the employee is found not qualified for the position.
3. In accordance with City Charter Section 153, the Commission shall not certify the pay of any individual duly given a temporary appointment for any time worked in excess of 480 hours within any consecutive twelve-month period.

A motion to approve the request was made, seconded, and passed unanimously.

\* \* \*

*RE: Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to adopt NFPA 1582, Comprehensive Occupational Medical Program for Fire Departments, 2007 Edition.*

PRESENT: Brenda Sobieck, Personnel Administrative Officer

Brenda Sobieck presented this request to adopt NFPA 1582, Chapter 6 and Annex A, as minimum medical requirements for City of Columbus firefighter candidates, excluding the vision section.

The Civil Service Commission currently utilizes the medical standards developed by the National Fire Protection Association (NFPA) for pre-employment physicals of firefighter applicants. The NFPA recently published a 2007 edition which the Commission staff has purchased. Alton J. Ball, M.D., M.P.H., Clinical Director of OSU Medicine, has been the City's designated Police/Fire Surgeon. Dr. Ball and Dr. Eric Schaub, also a physician for OSU Occupational Medicine, have reviewed the new standards and the differences between the 2007 and 2003 editions.

The most significant revision was to Section 6.18 (Endocrine and Metabolic disorders) which now allows applicants with diabetes to qualify to be firefighters if they can demonstrate they have closely monitored their glucose levels for at least one year, have no signs of diabetes related indicators, and have a signed statement from an

endocrinologist they that have stable control of blood glucose. Applicants not on insulin therapy must meet similar requirements showing their conditions are under control.

Section 6.8 (Lungs and chest Wall) contained some changes regarding applicants with asthma. If applicants have been off medication for two years and have met certain requirements for spirometry (breathing test) and "provocative challenge" testing, they can qualify to become a firefighter.

The Commission has maintained vision standards separate from the NFPA standards. No changes were recommended to the vision standards for Columbus firefighter applicants.

A motion to approve the request was made, seconded, and passed unanimously.

\* \* \*

*RE: Request of appellant, Gregory L. Fountain, to withdraw the appeal he filed January 5, 2006, regarding his nine-day suspension from the position of Food Service Helper with the Columbus Public Schools – Appeal Number 06-BA-0001.*

A motion to approve this request was made, seconded, and passed unanimously.

\* \* \*

*RE: Request of appellant, Mary Woodson, to withdraw the appeal she filed May 15, 2006, regarding her discharge from the position of Bus Driver with the Columbus Public Schools – Appeal Number 06-BA-0018.*

A motion to approve this request was made, seconded, and passed unanimously.

\* \* \*

*RE: Request of appellant, Catherine D. Polley, to withdraw the appeal she filed December 2, 2005, regarding her discharge from the position of Bus Driver with the Columbus Public Schools – Appeal Number 05-BA-0025.*

A motion to approve this request was made, seconded, and passed unanimously.

\* \* \*

*RE: Trial Board Recommendations.*

No trial board recommendations were submitted this month.

\* \* \*

*RE: Columbus Public School Classification Actions.*

No Columbus Public School classification actions were submitted this month.

\* \* \*

*RE: Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to revise the specification for the classification Computer Operator I (Class Code 0538).*

PRESENT: Barbara Crawford, Personnel Analyst II

Barbara Crawford presented this request to address an issue regarding minimum qualifications. Computer Operator I was created in 1965 and last reviewed in 2004. This class is considered an entry-level classification and is used exclusively in the Department of Technology (DoT). The current minimum qualifications require one year of experience operating a mainframe or multiple-network based servers (six months of experience and successful completion of two courses in the theory and operation of a computer may be

substituted for the required experience). At the time of the last review, DoT personnel did not foresee individuals with advanced degrees expressing an interest in this level of information technology.

During the most recent filing period for Computer Operator I, Commission staff received a number of applications from applicants who possessed four year degrees in information technology, but lacked the experience necessary to qualify to take the examination. DoT personnel, while preferring that applicants have hands-on experience, agreed that in all probability any candidate for a position in this classification would require training specific to the City's system. Therefore, it was recommended that the minimum qualifications be revised to read: One (1) year of experience operating a mainframe computer or multiple-network based servers. Substitution(s): Possession of an associate's degree in information technology, computer science, or closely related field may substitute for the required experience, or six (6) months of experience operating a mainframe computer or network-based servers and successful completion of two (2) courses in the theory and operation of a computer may be substituted for the required experience. It is therefore requested that the revisions to the minimum qualifications for the classification specification of Computer Operator I be approved as proposed.

A motion to approve the request was made, seconded, and passed unanimously.

\* \* \*

*RE: Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to create the specification for the classification Public Health Program Manager IV (RN), assign a probationary period of 365 days, designate the examination type as noncompetitive, and amend Rule XI accordingly.*

PRESENT: Tammy Rollins, Personnel Administrative Officer

Tammy Rollins presented this request as a result of a compensation practices survey conducted by an outside consultant. The survey revealed that program manager positions requiring an RN license are compensated differently in the market and therefore, in November 2006, a three-level classification series was created and titled Public Health Program Manager I, II, and III (RN).

Positions in the Columbus Public Health Department were closely reviewed to determine which of the new classes would be most appropriate for the responsibilities assigned/performed. Once it was determined that the position required an RN license and the new PHPM (RN) class series was most appropriate, the task was to determine which of the three levels of classifications in the new PHPM (RN) series was most appropriate. During this review it became apparent that one position had responsibilities assigned beyond what was defined by the PHPM III (RN) classification. It was therefore recommended that a PHPM IV (RN) classification be created to support the current responsibilities and hierarchy within the Columbus Public Health Department.

By definition the proposed classification is responsible for the direction of a major comprehensive health care program in the Columbus Public Health Department. The examples of work statements included those required for this position. It was recommended that a guidelines for class use be assigned to the classification in order to provide clarification on how this classification should function and how it is different from other classes in the same class series. The minimum qualification required possession of a valid Certificate of Authority from the Ohio Board of Nursing to practice nursing as a Certified Registered Nurse Anesthetist, Clinical Nurse Specialist, Certified Nurse-Midwife, or Certified Nurse Practitioner and five years of experience managing a public health service or program, two years of which must have involved supervising nursing (RN) staff. The proposed knowledge, skills, and abilities were developed to support the examples of work and minimum qualifications. It was recommended that the examination type be designated noncompetitive and that the probationary period be assigned 365 days.

A motion to approve the request was made, seconded, and passed unanimously.

\* \* \*

*RE: Personnel Action*

*Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to reallocate one position from Fingerprint Technician II (Class Code 3014) to the newly created Fingerprint Technician Specialist (Class Code 3015) and allow the affected incumbent to retain their classification seniority and status.*

PRESENT: Tammy Rollins, Personnel Administrative Officer

Tammy Rollins presented this request to reallocate position number 30-03-03073 in the Public Safety Department to the proposed specification for the classification Fingerprint Technician Specialist. Currently, the Department has one classification that is being used for positions performing as specialists or supervisors. This practice has proven troublesome to the Department in terms of recruiting and hiring for vacancies as well as for Civil Service in terms of developing employment examinations that assess the important knowledges, skills, and abilities. At the December Public Meeting, the Civil Service Commission approved the creation of a Fingerprint Technician Specialist classification to resolve these recurring issues.

With this classification now created, Commission staff is requesting that the position responsible for performing as the AFIS specialist be reallocated to the Fingerprint Technician Specialist classification and this employee be able to retain her classification seniority and status upon reallocation. While the classification title may be changing, the work assigned and performed by this employee will remain the same.

There is currently one individual identified and responsible for performing the duties and responsibilities defined by the newly created Fingerprint Technician Specialist classification. The designated individual meets the minimum qualifications of the new class, has completed the probationary period and has achieved permanent status in her current classification. It was, therefore, requested that the designated position be reallocated to the Fingerprint Technician Specialist classification once pay and bargaining unit has been assigned, and the affected employee retain her classification status and seniority.

A motion to approve the request was made, seconded, and passed unanimously.

\* \* \*

*RE: Personnel Action*

*Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to reallocate designated positions to one of several new Public Health Program Manager (RN) classifications determined to be most appropriate and allow the affected incumbents to retain their classification seniority and status.*

PRESENT: Tammy Rollins, Personnel Administrative Officer

Tammy Rollins presented this request. The Columbus Public Health Department enlisted Watson Wyatt Worldwide to conduct a compensation practices survey specific to the classes covered by the Administrative Salary Resolution (ASR). As a result of this survey, it was revealed that the City was underpaying their registered and advanced practice nurses. Also problematic was the Public Health Program Manager class series in which some positions allocated to this series required licensure as a registered nurse to perform assigned duties, and others did not. The survey clearly presented data that the program managers/RN should be compensated at a higher level than their counterparts, who were not registered nurses. Given this, a new classification series was created and was titled Public Health Program Manager I, II, III, and IV (RN).

Ten employees, currently classified in the generic Public Health Program Manager class series, were asked to complete a customized questionnaire that was developed to specifically ascertain the nursing (RN) knowledge and responsibilities. The first question to

be addressed was whether or not the position under review required an RN license; all of the employees possessed an RN licensure. However, it is important that positions be classified based on job responsibilities, not employee qualifications.

Once it was determined that the position required an RN license and the new Public Health Program Manager (RN) class series was most appropriate, the task was to determine which of the three levels of classifications in the new series was most appropriate. Based on the questionnaire data, a preliminary recommendation was made regarding which classification was most appropriate for the work performed. Meetings were subsequently held with Department representatives to review, discuss, and finalize the classification determinations for those employees included in this project.

Commission staff requested that designated positions be reallocated to one of several new classifications determined to be most appropriate based on the duties and responsibilities of the positions. It was further requested that the affected employees retain their classification seniority and status when reallocated to the new classification.

A motion to approve the request was made, seconded, and passed unanimously.

\* \* \*

RE: Residency Hearing Reviews.

No residency hearing reviews were submitted this month.

\* \* \*

RE: Administrative/Jurisdictional Reviews.

*Review of the appeal of Sandra Verhage regarding a denied request for review – Appeal No. 06-BA-0044.*

The Commissioners reviewed the appeal Ms. Verhage filed on December 12, 2006, regarding the rejection of her application for Sewer Maintenance Supervisor II. Ms. Verhage wrote in her appeal that she worked as a Sewer Telemonitoring Camera Operator for five years, a position which involved supervisory duties. After reviewing her appeal it was determined that her supervisory experience did meet the minimum qualifications for Sewer Maintenance Supervisor II (two years of experience engaged in the construction, maintenance, and repair of underground utilities or general construction work).

Based upon their review, the Commissioners granted Ms. Verhage's appeal and advised her to contact Commission staff members to schedule a date for the Sewer Maintenance Supervisor II examination.

Applicants Removed Post-Exam

Name of Applicant	Position applied for	BAR #
Lisa Thomas	Police Communications Technician	06-BR-111
Phillip Brown	Police Communications Technician	06-BR-112
Austin L. Byrd II	Police Officer	07-BR-001

After reviewing the file of Lisa Thomas, the Commissioners decided her name would be reinstated to the police communications technician eligible list.

After reviewing the file of Phillip Brown, the Commissioners decided his name would not be reinstated to the police communications technician eligible list. In addition, after reviewing the file of Austin L. Byrd II, the Commissioners decided his name would not be reinstated to the police officer eligible list.

\* \* \*

The meeting was adjourned at 1:04 p.m.

\* \* \*

---

Grady L. Pettigrew, Jr., President

---

Date