

Regular Meeting

November 26, 2007  
12:30 p.m.

A regular meeting of the Municipal Civil Service Commission convened on Monday, November 26, 2007, at 12:40 p.m. with Grady Pettigrew and Eileen Paley in attendance.

\* \* \*

*RE: Review and approval of the minutes from the October 29, 2007, regular meeting.*

A motion to approve the minutes was made, seconded, and passed unanimously.

\* \* \*

*RE: Pre-hearing Conference Reviews.*

There were no pre-hearing conference reviews conducted this month.

\* \* \*

*RE: Rule Revisions.*

No rule revisions were submitted this month.

\* \* \*

*RE: Review and Approval of the 2008 Civil Service Commission Full Commission Meeting/Hearing Schedule.*

The following dates for the 2008 Civil Service Commission regular Commission meetings and full Commission hearings were submitted for approval:

January 28	July 28
February 25	August 25
March 31	September 29
April 28	October 27
May 19	November 24
June 30	December 15

A motion to approve the request was made, seconded, and passed unanimously.

\* \* \*

*RE: Request of Appellant Yolanda Smith-Johnson to withdraw the appeal she filed January 24, 2007, regarding her 10-day suspension from the position of Bus Driver with the Columbus City Schools, Appeal #07-BA-0002.*

A motion to approve the request was made, seconded, and passed unanimously.

\* \* \*

*RE: Review of the Findings and Recommendation of the Trial Board hearing held on October 15, 2007, Madison McRae vs. Columbus City Schools, Appeal Number 06-BA-0024.*

A motion to adopt the trial board recommendation affirming the decision of Columbus City Schools to suspend Mr. McRae for five days was made, seconded, and passed unanimously.

\* \* \*

*RE: Review of the Findings and Recommendation of the Trial Board hearing held on October 24, 2007, Malkahn Miller vs. Columbus City Schools, Appeal Number 07-BA-0004.*

A motion to adopt the trial board recommendation affirming the decision of Columbus City Schools to terminate Mr. Miller was made, seconded, and passed unanimously.

\* \* \*

*RE: Columbus City Schools*

No Columbus City School classification actions were submitted this month.

\* \* \*

*RE: Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to approve the specification review for the classification Plant Maintenance Electrician I with no revisions (Class Code 3799).*

PRESENT: Richard Cherry, Personnel Analyst II

Richard Cherry presented this request as part of the Civil Service Commission's efforts to review all classifications every five years. Plant Maintenance Electrician I was last reviewed in April of 2002. There are currently twelve employees serving in this classification in the Sewerage and Drainage and the Power and Water Divisions of the Department of Public Utilities.

As part of this review, Civil Service reviewed questionnaires completed by incumbents and department/division representatives were solicited to provide feedback about potential changes. Based on this feedback, it was recommended that the required years of experience be increased from one to two years. However, AFSCME Local 1632 raised some issues with the proposed change that warrant further study. It was therefore, recommended that the review of the specification for the classification Plant Maintenance Electrician I be approved at this time with no revisions.

\* \* \*

*RE: Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to approve the specification review for the classification Building Inspection Manager with no revisions (Class Code 1771).*

*Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to approve the specification review for the classification Building Inspection Specialist with no revisions (Class Code 1773).*

PRESENT: Richard Cherry, Personnel Analyst II

Richard Cherry presented these two requests in response to the Commission's objective to review all classifications at least every five years to ensure accuracy.

Based on departmental feedback and Commission staff review, no proposed revisions were requested at this time. It was, therefore, recommended that the review of these two specifications be approved with no revisions.

A motion to approve the request was made, seconded, and passed unanimously.

\* \* \*

*RE: Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to revise the specification for the classification Plant Maintenance Electrician II (Class Code 3800).*

PRESENT: Richard Cherry, Personnel Analyst II

Richard Cherry presented this request as part of the Civil Service Commission's efforts to review all classifications every five years. Plant Maintenance Electrician II was last reviewed in March of 2002. There are currently five employees serving in this classification in the Power and Water Division. As part of this review, Civil Service reviewed questionnaires completed by incumbents and department/division representatives were solicited to provide feedback about potential changes. Based on this feedback, the following revisions were recommended.

It was recommended that the examples of work section be revised to include more duties involving safe work practices and performing preventative maintenance on equipment. It was recommended that the minimum qualifications be revised to require two years of experience working with at least 13,200 volts as a Plant Maintenance Electrician I with the City of Columbus or comparable experience. It was also recommended that the knowledge, skills, and abilities section be revised to include considerable knowledge of NFPA 70E and Electrical Safe Work Practices. Since work is performed on the computer, the ability to operate a personal computer and associated software was added. No other revisions were recommended.

A motion to approve the request was made, seconded, and passed unanimously.

\* \* \*

*RE: Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to revise the specification for the classification Automotive Mechanic Supervisor II, change the probationary period to 365 days, and amend Rule XI accordingly (Class Code 3457).*

PRESENT: Richard Cherry, Personnel Analyst II

Richard Cherry presented this request as part of the Civil Service Commission's efforts to review all classifications every five years. Automotive Mechanic Supervisor II was last reviewed in February of 2002. There are currently fourteen employees serving in this classification in the Finance Department, Fleet Management Division, and the Department of Public Utilities. Based upon feedback from questionnaires completed by incumbents and input from department/division representatives, the following revisions were recommended.

It was recommended that the current definition be expanded to include being responsible for supervising the work of employees performing skilled mechanical repair and maintenance work on diversified automotive/truck equipment. Revisions to the examples of work included the addition of duties that are more reflective of the work currently being performed by the Automotive Mechanic Supervisor II and the elimination of a duty that is no longer performed in the same manner. It was recommended that the minimum qualifications be revised to read, "completion of the twelfth school grade and two years of supervisory experience as an Automotive Mechanic Supervisor I with the City of Columbus or comparable experience and possession of a valid motor vehicle operator's license". Also, since some of the vehicles being worked on are heavy trucks, it was recommended that language be added to indicate some positions may require possession of a valid Class A or B commercial motor vehicle operator's license with an air brake endorsement by the completion of the probationary period. Recommendations to the knowledge, skills, and abilities section included adding knowledge of best practices in automotive/truck repair facilities, safety policies, procedures, and training, the ability to communicate effectively with others, and the ability to operate a computer and associated software.

Automotive Mechanic Supervisor II is the highest level fleet-related supervisory classification before reaching the managerial classifications and is the only classification of this level within the class plan that currently does not require a 365-day probationary period. It was therefore recommended that the probationary period be increased from 270 to 365 days. No revisions to the examination type were recommended.

A motion to approve the request was made, seconded, and passed unanimously.

\* \* \*

*RE: Request of the Civil Service Commission to revise the specification for the classification Utility Field Services Coordinator, retitle it to read Utility Services Coordinator, and amend Rule XI accordingly (Class Code 0863).*

PRESENT: Tammy Rollins, Personnel Administrative Officer

Tammy Rollins presented this request as a result of a letter from the Department of Public Utilities requesting a new classification be created to support the impending reorganization of the Power and Water Division and the disbandment of the Division of Operational Support; both of which are expected to occur in January of 2008. This request for a new classification would essentially combine Field Services Coordinator (pay grade 57) and Customer Services Coordinator (pay grade 59) into one class specification. There are currently two employees, one serving in each of these classes, who will transfer to the Division of Power and Water as part of the impending reorganization.

The City's Compensation Manager determined that pay grade 58 would be appropriate for both the field services job and the customer services job. Because it is no longer necessary to have two classifications to account for the two different pay grades, Commission staff recommended that the Utility Field Services Coordinator classification be revised and retitled to reflect work associated with both field services and customer services. A request was also presented to impose a moratorium on Utility Services Coordinator.

It was recommended the new classification be retitled to read Utility Services Coordinator with a definition indicating responsibility for coordinating utility field and/or customer services operations. The Department anticipates allocating two positions to this classification, each with significant managerial responsibilities for directly or indirectly supervising more than seventy-five positions. The examples of work section was broadened to incorporate the customer service function, which includes billing, customer service, and revenue collection from water, sewer, and electricity consumption. It was proposed that the minimum qualifications be revised to include customer service experience as a viable means of qualifying for this classification rather than just meter servicing and repair experience. One knowledge statement was recommended to the knowledge, skills, and abilities section to read, "considerable knowledge of accounting practices." No revisions to the probationary period or the examination type were recommended.

A motion to approve the request was made, seconded, and passed unanimously.

\* \* \*

*RE: Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to impose a hiring moratorium on the specification for the classification Utility Customer Services Coordinator (Class Code 0865).*

PRESENT: Tammy Rollins, Personnel Administrative Officer

Tammy Rollins presented this classification action as a result of a request from the Department of Public Utilities to create a new classification to support the impending reorganization of the Power and Water Division and the disbandment of the Division of Operational Support; both of which are expected to occur in January 2008. The request for a new classification would essentially combine Field Services Coordinator and Customer Services Coordinator into one class specification.

There are currently two employees within the Division of Operational Support who will transfer to the Division of Power and Water as part of the impending reorganization—one serving as a Utility Customer Services Coordinator (Class Code 0865), which is assigned pay grade 59, and one serving as a Utility Field Services

Coordinator (Class Code 0863), which is assigned pay grade 57. The Department consulted with the City's Compensation Manager who determined that pay grade 58 would be appropriate for both the field services and the customer services jobs.

Because it is no longer necessary to maintain two classifications to account for two different pay grades, Commission staff recommended that a hiring moratorium be imposed upon the Utility Customer Services Coordinator classification. Work assigned to this classification will be incorporated into the proposed Utility Services Coordinator classification. The proposed hiring moratorium would prevent the current incumbent from being negatively impacted as a result of the reorganization and would also prevent future use of this classification.

A motion to approve the request was made, seconded, and passed unanimously.

\* \* \*

*RE: Request of the Civil Service Commission to revise the specification for the classification Public Health Administrator (Planning and Preparedness), retitle it to read, Public Health Administrator (Planning and Peak Performance), and amend Rule XI accordingly (Class Code 0263).*

PRESENT: Tammy Rollins, Personnel Administrative Officer

Tammy Rollins presented this request as part of the Civil Service Commission's effort to review all classifications every five years. Public Health Administrator (Planning and Preparedness) was last reviewed in November of 2002. There is currently one employee serving in this classification in the Columbus Public Health Department.

It was recommended that the title be revised to reflect the current focus of the division - planning and peak performance - rather than on emergency preparedness. The definition was revised to include peak performance to reflect the change in the classification title and the word, Public, was added to correctly reference the Columbus Public Health Department. The examples of work section was revised to reflect the removal of references to preparedness and to include more detailed examples of work consistent with the planning and peak performance focus. All references to the Health Department were revised to correctly reference Columbus Public Health Department. Consistent with each of the other Public Health Administrator classifications, language was added to recognize the Public Health Administrators' role in providing leadership and direction in the event of a public health emergency. No revisions to the minimum qualifications, knowledge, skills, and abilities, probationary period, or examination type were recommended.

A motion to approve the request was made, seconded, and passed unanimously.

\* \* \*

*RE: Motion to adjourn regular meeting to go into Executive Session to consider the remaining agenda items.*

The Commissioners recessed the regular meeting to consider the remaining agenda items, came back on the record, and entered their decisions into the record as indicated below.

\* \* \*

*RE: Personnel Actions.*

No personnel actions were submitted this month.

\* \* \*

*RE: Residency Hearing Reviews.*

No Residency hearing reviews were submitted this month.

\* \* \*

*RE: Background Removals.*

Applicants Removed Pre-Exam	
Name of Applicant	Position Applied For
Roushaad Bingham	Police Officer
Elliott Dotson	Police Officer
Isaac Kraft	Police Communications Technician

After reviewing the files of Roushaad Bingham and Elliott Dotson, the Commissioners decided their applications would not be accepted and they would not be permitted to take the Police Officer examination.

After reviewing Isaac Kraft's file, the Commissioners decided his application would not be accepted and he would not be permitted to take the Police Communications Technician examination.

Applicants Removed Post-Exam		
Name of Applicant	Position Applied For	BAR #
Tammy Douglas	Police Officer	07-BR-080
Tia T. West	Police Communications Technician	07-BR-103
Randy T. Mathias	Police Officer	07-BR-108
Sulimon Saunders	Firefighter	07-BR-109
Derrick Ferguson	Police Officer	07-BR-110
Robert C. McNeal	Firefighter	07-BR-111
Benjamin E. Meier	Police Officer	07-BR-112

After reviewing the files of Tammy Douglas, Derrick Ferguson, and Benjamin E. Meier, the Commissioners decided their names would not be reinstated to the Police Officer eligible list.

After reviewing Randy T. Mathias's file, the Commissioners decided his name would be reinstated to the Police Officer eligible list.

After reviewing Tia T. West's file, the Commissioners decided her name would not be reinstated to the Police Communications Technician eligible list.

After reviewing Robert C. McNeal's file, the Commissioners decided his name would not be reinstated to the Firefighter eligible list.

After reviewing Sulimon Saunders's file, the Commission decided his name would be reinstated to the Firefighter eligible list.

\* \* \*

*RE: Other Administrative/Jurisdictional Reviews.*

*Review of the appeal of Kelley Brickey, regarding the denial of her Request for Review for Prevailing Wage Coordinator – Appeal No. 07-CA-0019.*

The Civil Service Commission reviewed the appeal Kelley Brickey filed on September 20, 2007. The basis of her appeal was that during her tenure with the City of Columbus she often performed duties typically associated with the Payroll Clerk and Prevailing Wage classifications and therefore should be approved for the Prevailing Wage Coordinator examination.

Based on the experience submitted with her application and a further review of the information she provided with her Request for Review, the Commission concurred

with Commission staff that Ms. Brickey's experience does not meet the minimum qualifications for Prevailing Wage Coordinator.

The Commissioners therefore upheld the rejection of her application for Prevailing Wage Coordinator and decided to dismiss her appeal without a hearing pursuant to Commission Rule XIII(G)(1).

*Review of the appeal of George J. Zonders, regarding the denial of his Request for Review for Public Relations Specialist II – Appeal No. 07-CA-0020.*

The Commissioners reviewed the appeal George Zonders filed on October 24, 2007, regarding the rejection of his application for Public Relations Specialist II with the Department of Public Utilities.

Mr. Zonders' application was rejected because he did not meet the specific college coursework requirements as outlined in the specification. Although his extensive experience was considered valuable it cannot be substitute for the education requirements for this classification.

The Commission therefore upheld the rejection of Mr. Zonders' application and decided to dismiss his appeal without a hearing pursuant to Commission Rule XIII(G)(1).

*Review of the appeal of Franchesca Druggan, regarding the denial of her Request for Review for Criminalist I – Appeal No. 07-CA-0021.*

The Commissioners reviewed the appeal Franchesca Druggan filed on October 29, 2007. The basis of her appeal was that she had the necessary coursework to meet the minimum qualifications for the Criminalist I classification and by the time the examinations were graded and a list established, she would have her bachelor's degree before the interview process began.

Civil Service Rule VI(D)(3) states in its pertinent part that, "Applicants must meet the requirements at the time of application review. . . .". At the time Ms. Druggan's application was reviewed by the Commission, she did not possess a bachelor's degree.

The Commission therefore decided to dismiss Ms. Druggan's appeal without a hearing pursuant to Commission Rule XIII(G)(1).

\* \* \*

*RE: Hearing on the merits of the appeal of Yefim Kunis vs. Columbus City Schools, from the action of the Columbus City Schools suspending him for 20 days from the position of EST Controls – Case No. 06-BA-0020.*

This trial board hearing was continued.

\* \* \*

The Commission adjourned its regular meeting at 1:04 p.m.

\* \* \*